

**From:** "Marya D. Crigler" <[MCrigler@tcadcentral.org](mailto:MCrigler@tcadcentral.org)>

**Date:** February 27, 2020 at 6:29:55 PM CST

**To:** Emily Chenevert <[echenevert@abor.com](mailto:echenevert@abor.com)>

**Cc:** Anthony Nguyen <[atn1972@gmail.com](mailto:atn1972@gmail.com)>, Blanca Zamora- <[blancagzamora@gmail.com](mailto:blancagzamora@gmail.com)>, Bruce Elfant <[bruce.elfant@co.travis.tx.us](mailto:bruce.elfant@co.travis.tx.us)>, Bruce Grube <[bfgrube@georgiasouthern.edu](mailto:bfgrube@georgiasouthern.edu)>, Felipe Ulloa <[fsulloa@gmail.com](mailto:fsulloa@gmail.com)>, James Valadez <[jvaladez@utexas.edu](mailto:jvaladez@utexas.edu)>, Ryan Steglich <[rsteglich@gmail.com](mailto:rsteglich@gmail.com)>, Theresa Bastian <[theresa@letsmoveaustin.com](mailto:theresa@letsmoveaustin.com)>, Tom Buckle <[tbuckle@sbylaw.com](mailto:tbuckle@sbylaw.com)>, Romeo Manzanilla <[romeo@realtyaustin.com](mailto:romeo@realtyaustin.com)>

**Subject:** RE: ABoR + TCAD Meeting Recap

I appreciate you having a conversation with me this morning. I'd like to iterate the fact that I'm always agreeable to sit down to resolve any potential or existing issues that ABoR and TCAD may find themselves in.

I'd like to clarify some points you've made from our meeting this morning. I understand the claims made by ABoR about its copyright restrictions and rules that it claims restricts its ability to disseminate the sales data from the MLS. However, for purpose of clarity, TCAD has not conceded with ABoR's contention that TCAD's use or access to such data is a violation of any intellectual property right. Nor does TCAD believe that the data it received from CoreLogic was a violation of any such right. To the contrary, CoreLogic represented to TCAD that it was authorized to sell and deliver that data to TCAD. Absent proof to the contrary, TCAD accepts that representation as accurate. Indeed, neither ABoR or CoreLogic have been willing to share with us the terms of their contractual agreement that would allow us to evaluate those claims. Also, as we discussed in the meeting, TCAD respects the confidential nature of the MLS data and has complied with the requirements of Local Government Code 552.149.

While TCAD understands that ABoR has held out that ABoR cannot share the MLS data with TCAD given ABoR's claims of proprietary nature of the data, ABoR does possess the data necessary to fulfill the statutory requirements imposed by the legislature on TCAD. We appreciate ABoR acknowledging the necessity for TCAD to have access to the market data required to fulfill TCAD's statutory duties. While we may cordially agree to disagree on the best method to share market data it is our hope that we may move forward cooperatively in seeking solutions that are legal and fair to all property owners.

As we have previously stated, TCAD has analyzed the available data and concluded that it is insufficient to recalibrate existing residential appraisal models. Despite TCAD's efforts to collect data from a variety of sources, the limited data TCAD has does not indicate any change in current market values. Using aggregate data to do across-the-board increases would violate the Texas Property Code, International Association of Assessing Officers Mass Appraisal Standards, and Uniform Standards of Professional Practices. It would be illegal for TCAD to change market values without having the data to support those changes. Travis County property owners deserve better. During a time where property owners are struggling with affordability issues, every dollar matters. TCAD cannot and will not increase property values without the data to support it.

***Thanks,***

**Marya D. Crigler, RPA**

Chief Appraiser

Travis Central Appraisal District

8314 Cross Park Drive

Austin TX 78754

(512) 834-9317 ext. 337

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This communication is intended only for the use of the individual or entity to which it is addressed and may contain confidential and/or privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient of this information, please delete all of the material from any computer that may have it. Any unauthorized use, dissemination, distribution, or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited.